

City of Dexter Facility Committee

Executive Summary

Improvements to City (then Village) facilities have been a consideration during discussions of governmental priorities for many years. In 2006, the Village issued \$1.7 million in bonds used mainly to fund the building of a new DPW and salt storage facility. This much needed project provided a significant improvement to the working conditions for the DPW employees, as well as providing for proper storage for City vehicles and equipment. The original public notice for the bond was in the amount of \$2.8 million, leaving \$1.1 in noticed, but unissued bonds still available to be sold for facility improvement purposes.

Summary from 2007 to 2012 will be distributed once prepared.

In 2013, Village officials turned the discussion to improving the Village Offices and the Fire Station. The Facility Committee consisting of Shawn Keough, Paul Cousins, and Julie Knight began meeting again in earnest. A joint meeting of the Village Council/Downtown Development Authority was held in August 2013 to discuss possible DDA involvement in a facility solution. Beginning in August 2013, Fred Schmid joined the Committee as a representative from the DDA. Former City Manager Donna Dettling, City Manager Courtney Nicholls and Assistant to the Manager Justin Breyer have served as staff representatives on the committee. In November 2014, Jim Smith joined the committee after his return to the Council (previously served on the Committee from January 2008 to November 2012).

As the Facility Committee reviewed the various facility data (i.e. potential locations, cost estimates, etc..) that had been gathered over the years, it became apparent that the data to make an "apples to apples" comparison of the options was not available and needed to be updated. To determine the Village's facility needs, which relocation options were feasible and to generate comparable cost estimates between the options, the Facility Committee recommended that City Council hire a Professional Architect to assist the Facility Committee in answering these questions. In March 2014, the City issued a Request for Proposals for an architect to complete a condition assessment of the existing facilities, a needs assessment and feasibility study. The project description as defined by the RFP was as follows:

Over the past several years, the Village has explored several ideas for improving 8140 Main for the fire department and finding a permanent home for Village Offices. The Village is outgrowing its existing office space. The current office is too small, is deficient in employee space, lacks adequate conference room space, and doesn't currently have a large town hall meeting room. In 2009, the Village purchased a 4 acre piece of property on the southern edge of the Village. The property currently contains a farmhouse and the Village Community Garden, but has been considered as a possible site to construct a new Fire Station. The Village has also discussed renovating the Fire Station at its current location.

The Village is seeking assistance from a creative, innovative municipal facility architect that can offer guidance and structure through the process of evaluating the various options to aid Village Council in their future planning for facility improvements. This study will include gathering and sharing information with a variety of staff, elected officials and members of the general public.

The project includes the following tasks:

- *Perform a needs assessment of the Fire Department, Sheriff's Office and Village Offices*
 - o *The needs assessment of the fire department should take into account the additional facilities under consideration by other DAFD communities.*
- *Use the needs assessment to provide concepts for the following options:*
 1. *Renovate 8140 Main to house both the Fire Department/Sheriff's Sub Station and Village Office*
 2. *Renovate 8140 Main to house the Sheriff's Sub-Station/Village Offices and build a new Fire Department at 7651 Dan Hoey*
 3. *Renovate 8140 Main to house the Sheriff's Sub-Station/Fire Department and provide a square footage estimate for Village Offices at an undetermined downtown location*

We received 11 proposals and 6 firms were interviewed. Village Council voted to enter into a contract with **Partners in Architecture** in June 2014. The contract amount was \$13,900 with an additional \$1,600 for reimbursable expenses. A total budget of \$20,000 was approved by Council to provide a contingency amount for additional work. The amount spent as of June 3, 2016 is \$13,413.50.

The first step in the process was the completion of a facility condition assessment for the current Fire Station. The architects toured 8140 Main Street and noted deficiencies in the facility from a code and usage perspective. The data from this evaluation is compiled in the Facility Assessment document dated January 14, 2015.

During this time a needs assessment was also prepared, based on interviews with user groups from the Fire Department, Sheriff's Office and City Office. The user groups included Village employees, Dexter Area Fire Department staff, the Chair of the Dexter Area Fire Board (Jim Seta), Sheriff Deputies and the Facility Committee. The data from this evaluation was compiled in the Needs Assessment documents.

Based on the data collected in the needs and facility assessments, the architects began putting together concept scenarios in accordance with the RFP. Work sessions with Village/City Council were held in September 2014, October of 2014 and January of 2015. On February 28, 2015 and April 25, 2015 the concepts were presented at public forums at the Dexter District Library.

The general outline of the created concepts is as follows:

A1, A2, A3	Fire, Sheriff and City Offices at 8140 Main – Renovation with expansion
B1, B1.1	Sheriff and City Offices at 8140 Main – Renovation with expansion
B2	Sheriff and City Offices at 8140 Main – New Building
B3, B3.1, B3.2, B3.3	Fire and Sheriff at 8140 Main - Renovation with expansion
C1, C2	New Fire Station on Dan Hoey (could be used on any green site)
D	Estimate for Relocation of City Offices to an Alternative Location

Most of the community comments and feedback that was provided by the public can be summarized as follows:

- Don't overspend on wants...spend within our needs.
- Police and Fire should remain together (many people like their visible presence on Main Street).
- The space shown for Sheriff seems too large on some concepts.
- The A series concepts are generally viewed as too expensive.
- Firefighters (including those present at the public meetings) have expressed the opinion that they did not like the Dan Hoey site due to increased response times.
- The square foot comparisons between options are difficult to relate to the large cost estimates provided.

Other sites were discussed as possible green site locations for the Fire Station. Options within City boundaries include property owned by MAV Development on Dexter Ann Arbor, vacant property on Second and Edison, and the Adair property on Second. Options outside of the City boundaries include a parcel at 7495 Joy at Mast and the American Legion property on Dexter Pinckney. The selection of these properties would increase the cost estimates due to the need to purchase the land.

The Committee discussed possible alternate locations for City offices in addition to 8140 Main, including the idea of building a City office on the DDA's property at 3045 Broad and purchasing space in the Mill Creek Terrace Building. The Committee brainstormed a list of speculative locations (i.e. WISD Building near Monument Park, etc.) however this list wasn't very long or deemed to be very practical given the City didn't own any of these speculative locations and many of them weren't even for sale. With the ongoing process to redevelop 3045 Broad Street into a mixed use/residential property, 3045 Broad was not viewed by the Committee as a viable option.

The Mill Creek Terrace Building was presented as a viable option that would meet the City's needs for the foreseeable future (a cost estimate and basic layout are included with this summary). The basic layout could be refined but shows that our space needs would be sufficiently met.

In August 2015, the Committee requested that the architect help to perform a basic study of run times from the two Fire Station sites under consideration. Dispatch data from Huron Valley Ambulance was obtained for 2013 and 2014. Using the 2013 data, the architects mapped the run times to calls for service from 8140 Main and 7651 Dan Hoey. Through this study, it was determined that moving the Fire Station from 8140 Main to 7651 Dan Hoey would increase run times to some areas of the City (including our historic downtown), while some areas would see a reduction in run times. The relocation would increase run times for the majority of the runs to our partner communities (Dexter Township and Webster Township). The Committee acknowledges that any relocation of the Fire Department will have an impact on run times. A further analysis on the run times would be necessary for any site chosen.

The Committee discussed and reviewed the plan for Dexter Township's fire station. The construction of this station could have an impact on the number of runs responded to from the main station. Currently, the Dexter Township station is staffed with one full time fire fighter, so a minimum of one additional fire fighter within the service area must also respond to the call. The Dexter Township station was designed to house two full time fire fighters with the option of expanding to four. If, in the future, the Dexter Area Fire Department chooses to station two fire fighters at the Dexter Township station the number of medical calls responded to from the main station may be reduced, depending on deployment protocols.

In early 2016, the architects were asked to make modifications to reduce the cost for the options to use 8140 Main for either the Fire Station/Sheriff Substation or City Offices by focusing on needs, not wants. This resulted in the creation of Alternatives B1.1 (\$2,550,000), B3.1 (\$4,114,000), and B3.2 (\$3,860,000).

The architect was also asked to review the Fire Station report provided by the Fire Chief. An updated concept based on this review is included in the Summary Report (concept C1.1).

The Summary Report created by Partners in Architecture provides more detail on the facility assessment, needs assessment and concept scenarios. A general summary of the concept scenarios and the pros and cons associated with each is provided below.

Facility Scenario Detail

1. Renovate 8140 Main to house both the Fire Department/Sheriff's Sub Station and City Offices

This series of options creates a municipal campus that contains the three governmental services in one building.

The options created are described in the A series of concepts (A1, A2, A3).

Cost for the A series of concepts ranges from \$5,139,000 to \$7,307,000.

Advantages for the A series of concepts:

General

- Common space shared by three entities
- Encourages increased intergovernmental contact between the City, Fire and Sheriff
- One location for the residents/business owners to access City, Fire and Sheriff services
- Potential for shared use of spaces (conference room for City Offices could also function as training room for Fire Dept)
- Creates access to Mill Creek Park North via elevator and access to public restrooms
- Keeps fire department and sheriff prominently located downtown
- Creates aesthetically pleasing prominent focal point downtown
- Maintenance of only one facility
- Adds additional downtown parking for approx. \$600,000
- Fully utilizes land currently owned by the City, eliminates need to pay rent/condo fees
- Demonstrates that there is enough space at 8140 Main to house all three functions

Fire Specific

- Creates wider and deeper bays for fire department apparatus
- Expanded and reorganized administration area and living quarters
- Adds facilities for female firefighters
- Removes storage from apparatus bays
- Compliance with OSHA, NFPA, ADA, and building code requirements and fire state design guidelines
- Quick access for response to City and DAFD coverage area via major roads (Dexter Pinckney, Main, Island Lake, Dexter Chelsea) and several routes to get to Central/Mast that provide access to the north and east to maintain current response times to the City and DAFD service area

Sheriff Specific

- Increases secure functional space, including addition of an interview area
- Adds appropriate locker room and staff areas

City Office Specific

- Increases secure functional space, including addition of a conference room and Council Chambers
- Creates appropriate staff and public ADA compliant accommodations
- Added storage

Disadvantages for the A series of concepts:

General

- Costs for all A series scenarios are high

Fire Specific

- Traffic on Main Street
- Displacement of fire personnel during construction

2. Renovate 8140 Main to house the Sheriff's Sub-Station/City Offices and build a new Fire Department at 7651 Dan Hoey

The options to renovate 8140 Main for the Sheriff/City Offices and build a new Fire Station in a new location are described in the B and C series of concepts (B1, B2, B3, C1, C2).

The cost estimate for construction the Fire Station at 7651 Dan Hoey is \$3,505,000 (C series). C1 and C2 are the same building design, with mirror image layouts. Option C1.1 was created based upon input from the Fire Chief's facility report. The cost estimate for that option is \$5,000,000.

The cost estimate for the 8140 Main renovation for the Sheriff's Sub-Station and City Offices is \$2,431,000 (B1). An additional concept for the renovation into Sheriff's Sub-Station/City Office was created in concept B1.1 at an estimated cost of \$2,550,000.

A cost estimate was also provided that includes tearing down the existing building, building a new building for City Offices and the Sheriff and creating additional parking for \$5,272,000 (B2). Please note that \$1,640,000 of that cost is the construction cost for additional parking.

The total estimated cost for building a new fire station on a green site and renovating 8140 Main for Sheriff/City Office using concepts B1 and C1 is \$5,936,000.

Advantages for the B & C series of concepts:

General

- Fully utilizes land currently owned by the City, eliminates need to pay rent/condo fees
- Creates access to Mill Creek Park North via elevator and access to public restrooms
- Adds additional downtown parking

Fire Specific

- New facility specifically designed for fire service
- Drive through apparatus bays
- Reduced traffic when pulling out onto Dan Hoey Rd. (at times other than school dismissal hours)
- Improved response times to southern portion of the City; proximity to Industrial Park and Schools
- No displacement of fire personnel during construction
- Creates wider and deeper bays for fire department apparatus
- Expanded and reorganized administration area and living quarters
- Adds facilities for female firefighters
- Removes storage from apparatus bays
- Compliance with OSHA, NFPA, ADA, and building code requirements and fire state design guidelines

Sheriff Specific

- Increases secure functional space, including addition of an interview area
- Adds appropriate locker room and staff areas

City Office Specific

- Increases secure functional space, including addition of a conference room and Council Chambers
- Creates appropriate staff and public ADA compliant accommodations
- Added storage

Disadvantages for the B & C series of concepts:

General

- Cost
- Maintenance of two facilities
- Possible elimination/need for relocation of Community Garden

Fire Specific

- Traffic on Baker Rd and Dan Hoey will restrict emergency vehicle access
- Adds additional travel time to access the major roads including Dexter Chelsea, Mast/Central, Main, Island Lake and Dexter Pinckney
- Longer response times to north and western portions of City, including the historic downtown, older homes in the central village area, and northern portion of DAFD service area

The Facility Committee also discussed the possibility of utilizing an alternate site in or around the City for the Fire Station. Options discussed are as follows:

- Vacant MAV property on Dexter Ann Arbor Rd
The MAV property would provide direct access to Dexter Ann Arbor Rd.
Land cost is estimated at \$700,000 for the entire parcel (negotiation would be necessary to determine whether a portion of the parcel could be purchased)
- Property located at 3610 Edison (along Second Street)
Land is currently for sale for \$350,000. Property is located in a residential area, not on a major street.
- Property located at 7850 Second (current Adair Printing)
Purchase price – listed at \$1,200,000
- Property located at 7495 Joy (along Mast)
Land is currently for sale at \$300,000
Potential to partner with Webster Township to build one station at this location as suggested by Fire Chief Smith. Further discussion with the Township is necessary.
- Property located at 8225 Dexter Chelsea
Currently owned by the American Legion; not officially listed but they would be willing to discuss the sale of a portion of their property

More detailed information on the properties can be found in the binder tab titled – Other Properties Considered.

3. Renovate 8140 Main to house the Sheriff's Sub-Station/Fire Department and provide square footage estimate for City Offices at an undetermined downtown location

The options created are described in the B and D series of concepts.

The original Cost estimate to renovate 8140 Main for fire and sheriff is \$4,673,000 (B3). This was further refined to \$4,114,360 in concept B3.1. The architect did a further refinement in an effort to save cost and created concept B3.2. This reduced the cost to \$3,860,000. B3.3 is a third refinement of concept B3 that eliminates the elevator and connection to Alpine – this is estimated at \$3,100,000.

Cost estimate for the build out of an office space for City Offices ranges from \$738,000 to \$784,000 (land cost not included) is included as concept D.

Advantages for this concept:

General

- Keeps fire department prominently located downtown
- Maintenance of one building
- Creates access to Mill Creek Park North via elevator and access to public restrooms
- Adds additional downtown parking

Fire Specific

- Creates wider and deeper bays for fire department apparatus
- Expanded and reorganized administration area and living quarters
- Adds facilities for female firefighters
- Removes storage from apparatus bays
- Compliance with OSHA, NFPA, ADA, and building code requirements and fire state design guidelines
- Maintains current response times to north east portions of the City and northern DAFD service area

Sheriff Specific

- Increases secure functional space, including addition of an interview area
- Adds appropriate locker room and staff areas

City Office Specific

- Increases secure functional space, including addition of a conference room and Council Chambers
- Creates appropriate staff and public ADA compliant accommodations
- Added storage

Disadvantages for this concept:

Fire Specific

- Traffic on Main Street
- Displacement of fire personnel during construction

****Possible locations for City Offices discussed include:**

- Future Mill Creek Terrace at 150 Jeffords
This option requires purchase of a condo inside the building.
- 8080 Grand
Option brought up by Council Member Semifero. This option would require purchase and demolition of the building. Considered when it was for sale; it has since been purchased.

Mill Creek Terrace (150 Jeffords) as the downtown office location.

Per realtor John Evans the entire property is for sale by the Schulz Family for \$750,000.

It would be possible for the City to purchase up to 6,750 square feet of space on the main floor of the future three story building. The cost estimate provided by Rene Papo of Magellan Properties (who is considering purchasing the property from the Schulz family) is between \$210 and \$225 per square foot (\$1,417,500 to \$1,518,750).

More detailed information can be found in the binder tab titled – Mill Creek Terrace (150 Jeffords).

Advantages for this concept:

- Located adjacent to Mill Creek Park.
- City does not incur land cost or the cost of building the entire structure.
- City would not be responsible for maintenance on the shell of the building.
- Brings added tax dollars to the DDA through the proposed residential units on the two floors above the office.
- Becoming the anchor tenant gets the building built which is another step in implementing the DDA Development Plan.
- If a future Council wanted to relocate City Offices the condo would be an asset that is marketable as office or retail space.
- Allows the City Office location decision to be made independent of the decision on the location of the Fire Station.

Disadvantages for this concept:

-

General Assumptions

- The City continues to participate as a member of the Dexter Area Fire Department
- The City continues to contract with the Washtenaw County Sheriff for Police Services
- Run information based on 2013 and 2014 DAFD run data.

Summary

After 18 months of consulting with the architect, gathering feedback from user groups, brainstorming new ideas and discussing the various options the Facility Committee is prepared to submit the following options for Council's discussion and review

City Office

- Remain at 8123 Main Street; continue to pay rent in the amount of \$10,800 per year for the City Office and \$7,500 for meeting space at the Dexter Senior Center.
- Purchase a condo of approximately 6,750 square feet at 150 Jeffords (Mill Creek Terrace); estimated cost \$1,417,500 to \$1,518,750; condo fees estimated at \$1 per square foot annually
- Renovate 8140 Main for City Offices; estimated cost \$2,550,000
 - o Would require the relocation of the Fire Station to a new location; estimated cost \$3,505,000
 - o Estimated annual maintenance costs for facility would need to be determined.
- Renovate 8140 Main for City Offices, Fire Station and Sheriff Substation; estimated cost range \$5,139,000 to \$7,307,000.
 - o Estimated annual maintenance costs for facility would need to be determined.

Fire Station

- Relocate Fire Station to a new location; estimated cost \$3,505,000
 - o Estimated annual maintenance costs for facility would need to be determined.
- Renovate 8140 Main Street for the Fire Department; estimated cost \$3,860,000
 - o Estimated annual maintenance costs for facility would need to be determined.
- Renovate 8140 Main for City Offices, Fire Station and Sheriff Substation; estimated cost range \$5,139,000 to \$7,307,000.
 - o Estimated annual maintenance costs for facility would need to be determined.

Sheriff Substation

- All costs above for 8140 Main renovation include the renovation of the Sheriff substation.

At the March 4, 2016 meeting of the Facility Committee, Council Member Smith presented the following motion for the Committee's consideration: Based on the information received from our consultant, our Fire Chief and other sources, the Facility Committee recommends to the Dexter City Council that 8140 Main Street no longer be considered as a site for a future Fire Station going forward. Facility Committee Members Cousins, Smith, Schmid and Knight voted in favor of this motion. Mayor Keough voted against it. City Manager Nicholls also expressed that she was not in support of the motion.

The above recommendation was submitted to City Council at their March 14, 2016 regular Council meeting during a Facility Committee report.

Committee member Cousins put forth a second motion for consideration: In conjunction with this recommendation, the Facility Committee's next step will be an evaluation of potential sites for a fire station that would include an area north of town as mentioned by the Fire Chief in his report (with possible collaboration with Webster Township) and other sites that may be identified in the near future. Our goal will be to have a recommended site to Council no later than June 30, 2016. Prior to the vote it was clarified that the intention of the motion was to search for new sites with the continued exclusion of 8140 Main Street. Facility Committee Members Cousins, Smith, and Schmid voted in favor of this motion. Mayor Keough voted against it. City Manager Nicholls also expressed that she was not in support of the motion. Committee member Knight left the meeting prior to the presentation of the second motion for consideration.

